

**COMMUNITY VIEWS
ON
BEST PRACTICES AND LESSONS
LEARNED FROM ERETO 1**

**Report on the Information Sharing Workshop
held at Endulen Hospital, Endulen, NCA
on 30th March 2005**

**COMPILED BY CAROL SORENSEN
ASSISTED BY MIRIAM OLE MOITA AND LAZARO OLE KOSYANDO**

COMMUNITY VIEWS ON BEST PRACTICES AND LESSONS LEARNED FROM ERETO 1

**Report on the Workshop
held at Endulen Hospital, Endulen, NCA
on 30th March 2005**

1. Introduction

The workshop was attended by 36 people, representing Ewoloto Committees from Phase 1 from each of the six wards of Ngorongoro conservation Area (NCA), the Pastoralist Council (PC), the Ngorongoro Conservation Area Authority (NCAA) and Ereto (see list of participants, attached). The facilitators were Naomi Kipuri and Carol Sørensen, consultants commissioned by Ereto 2 to document best practices and lessons learned from Ereto 1.

The purpose of the workshop was to bring together key stakeholders in Ereto 1, to verify achievements of the project, gain a broad agreement on the impact of phase 1, and identify the best ways of promoting sustainable pastoralist livelihoods.

Workshop objectives

1. To analyse the impact of Phase 1 on poverty
2. To describe good/bad practices from Phase 1
3. If time permitting, to identify some of the lessons learned from Phase 1

AGENDA

- Blessing of the meeting (a customary Maasai practice)
- Introductions
- Presentation of objectives
- Agreement on the proposed agenda
- Selection of workshop officials
- Tea break
- Introduction to the themes
- Formation of thematic groups
- Group discussion
- Group reports on impact of Phase 1
- Lunch
- Group reports on impact of Phase 1
- Plenary discussions on themes
- Identification of lessons learned and good practices
- Closing of workshop
- Blessing the participants

Mr Metui ole Shaudo, PC Chairman, was voted to chair the workshop for the morning session and Mr Saimon Ole Naseya, Olaigwanani (customary Maasai leader) from Endulen, to chair for the afternoon session.

2. The workshop process

Once the objectives had been explained and the agenda agreed, the participants were divided into four groups:

Thematic working groups

1. Poverty and restocking group
2. Water and pasture management group
3. Vet service delivery group
4. Strengthening institutions and empowering communities group

The thematic groups were requested to carefully recall and record the achievements of Ereto 1, in terms of accomplished interventions or activities. After this, each thematic group was to discuss Phase 1 in terms of before, during and after Phase 1, and from this, to assess the impact of the various interventions within their theme on poverty.

Plenary session

Each thematic group's presented their findings on the achievements and impact of Ereto 1, which were verified and expanded on by the other workshop participants. Lessons from each theme were then identified in plenary. In addition, gender was discussed and analysed as a cross cutting issue.

3. Findings of the Thematic Working Groups as agreed in plenary:

Firstly the underlying causes of poverty were identified and agreed on in plenary.

The main causes of poverty in NCA

- Cattle rustling – this occurs regularly in Kakesio, Endulen and Olbalbal wards, and occasionally in Oloirobi Ward. Livestock raids are carried out by neighbouring Sukuma and Irakq. Maasai also raid Sukuma and Irakq livestock
- Periodic drought – occurs unpredictably between and within rainy seasons, when it becomes necessary to herd cattle over long distances to access water and grazing resources. Often drought causes many livestock deaths.
- Livestock diseases – all livestock diseases are found in NCA, and are costly to treat
- Inadequate services (education, health, veterinary, infrastructure, markets) - most of NCA has poor service provision, which is difficult for some communities to access due to the great distance between services. Lack of services seems to increase the impact of poverty.
- Limitations imposed by NCAA on pastoralist access to natural resources – this has lead to decrease in the amount of water and forage available for livestock production
- Poor representation of pastoralists in Government/NCAA – means that pastoralists cannot influence Government/NCAA and the regulations affecting their livelihoods. NGOs do not function well in NCA.

- No permitted alternative livelihood options – NCAA does not allow cultivation and limits pastoralist access to engaging in the tourism industry or other income generating activities
- Poor education, especially of women – the majority cannot read or speak Kiswahili, the national language. This means that it is difficult to influence policies and regulations concerning their livelihoods. Also fewer livelihood options are available, even outside NCA.

The following is a summary of the workshop findings, as presented, discussed and recorded in plenary.

3. 1 FINDINGS ON THE RESTOCKING COMPONENT OF ERETO 1

Achievements of Ereto 1 in restocking

Ereto 1, together with the local pastoralist communities, restocked 3,400 of the poorest families in NCA with 9 livestock units (8 heifers and 10 female small stock) each, building on a traditional pastoralist poverty alleviation mechanism called Ewoloto. The project's contribution to the restocking was managed by Ewoloto Committees, one for each of the six wards of NCA. The Ewoloto Committee comprised of the Ward Councillor (Diwani), two senior customary leaders (Ilaigwanak), the project field officer and an elected woman. The process was planned for and monitored through quarterly Information Sharing Workshops (ISW) hosted by Ereto 1 and was attended by all the Ewoloto Committees of NCA.

Communities provided half the livestock which were then matched by the project according to mutually agreed plans. The community contribution of livestock came from within the NCA, while the project matching grant came from outside NCA (as there were not enough heifers available within the NCA for the exercise). Ilaigwanak and other knowledgeable people purchased the livestock for the project, determining when it was suitable to purchase livestock in relation to available pasture.

After restocking, the project provide free veterinary services to the re-stocked families' livestock for two years, and the NCAA (with funding from PC) provided 45kg of maize to the restocked families each month for three years. The purchase of maize was managed by the NCAA and the distribution of maize to the restocked families was managed by the Ewoloto Committees.

Impact of ewoloto/restocking on poverty

- ⇒ Increased availability of livestock based food
- ⇒ No more starvation, improved human nutritional levels
- ⇒ Community's health generally improved
- ⇒ Reduced need to compete for part time work (e.g. sale of firewood)
- ⇒ Begging for food reduced
- ⇒ People no longer scavenge for food (e.g. around grinding mills)
- ⇒ Reduced number of people loitering – people now working as pastoralists

- ⇒ People gained their self respect
- ⇒ People able to marry (as livelihoods become secure)
- ⇒ Re-stocked people re-integrated into the communities and able to take part in community decision making
- ⇒ Restocked people now able to contribute toward the community and community development
- ⇒ Restocked families able to pay school fees for their children and hospital/medical fees for the sick
- ⇒ Ewoloto, as a community based activity, was re-vamped
- ⇒ Other customary poverty reduction mechanisms stimulated
- ⇒ Community leadership, both customary and formal, was strengthened
- ⇒ Women able to own livestock, especially cattle, in their own right

Limitations identified

The following limitations to the activities or incompletely implemented activities were identified and recorded:

- ⇒ Maize delivery was not timely or adequate (in terms of quality and quantity)
- ⇒ Not all poor people identified were fully re-stocked (in Naiyobi 214 shoats and 8 heifers short of the expected number)
- ⇒ Some cattle died when the private vet stopped providing services to Ewoloto families' cattle at the end of Ereto 1.
- ⇒ Some livestock families died from external factors such as drought or were lost through cattle rustling
- ⇒ Some of the poorest of the poor were not reached by the project (as they were not restocked by their families) and remain the responsibility of the community.

Lessons learned about reducing poverty amongst pastoralists

- *Pastoralists have effective and functioning poverty alleviation mechanisms*
- *Working with customary institutions to alleviate poverty works*
- *Restocking is a long term practical mechanism for reducing poverty (providing food and capital) as well as a mechanism which immediately re-integrates the poor into society (providing acceptable social standing)*
- *Restocking women has made dramatic changes in the customary ownership of cattle, so women can now own cattle. This empowers*

women within the community to take part in public decision making and in income earning ventures

- *Restocking as a project intervention should go hand in hand with provision of vet services and food for the restocked family, as well as ensuring access for livestock to good pasture and water resources*

3.2 FINDINGS ON PASTORALIST WATER AND PASTURE MANAGEMENT

Achievements of Ereto 1 in pastoralist water development

All the planned project water interventions were completed. These were:

- Rehabilitation of silted Ololtanaudo Dam
- Rehabilitation of Kakesio borehole, installations of a wind-pump & delivery system for humans and livestock
- Construction of 4 hand dug wells fitted with hand pumps
- Replacement of the silted dam at Bitin with the Ngarusi dam
- Construction of Esere water system for humans and livestock
- Construction of rock catchment dam in Gol
- Rehabilitation of Njureta wind pump in Gol Mountains area
- Rehabilitation of Endoldol pipeline water delivery system (human and livestock) in Ngoile village
- Construction of Ilangaar'tutukie pipeline water delivery system (humans and livestock) in Meshili village
- Reconstruction of Irmisigiyo earth dam
- Construction of earth dam at natural pans of Ndepes
- Reconstruction and extension of EMungi River pipeline water delivery system for humans and livestock
- Water inventory and Feasibility Study conducted by in-house consultants in collaboration with communities, NCAA/PC. Available in all villages of NCA

ISW planned for interventions with Ereto 1 staff. Water development plans were approved by the project Steering Committee and NCAA provided EIA. A water feasibility study was completed for the whole of NCA and copies given to each village.

Private water engineers were contracted by Ereto 1 to manage works, and private companies contracted to carry out the works. PLA training was given to project staff, selected members of PC<NCAA and communities, especially to learn about pastoralist land use water development needs. Water user groups were formed by communities to manage the development of each intervention, and to maintain the intervention after completion. Technical training was provided to maintain pipelines and wind and hand pumps.

Impact of water development carried out by Ereto 1

- ⇒ Water sources were improved
- ⇒ Increased availability of water for people and livestock
- ⇒ Reduced conflict between wildlife and livestock as there is increased access to water and pasture and rotational grazing which avoids wildlife can be practiced
- ⇒ Reduced work loads for women when fetching water for domestic use
- ⇒ Hygiene improved
- ⇒ Clinics and schools enabled to function better where water is made available
- ⇒ Water borne diseases reduced
- ⇒ Grazing lands regained, especially in Kakesio, Endulen, Nainokanoka, Olbalbal and Oloirobi
- ⇒ Conflicts between pastoralists reduced as rotational grazing regimes are re-established, as strategic water resource development increases access to key pasture resources
- ⇒ EIA conducted by NCAA to reduce environmental impact, especially of new water developments
- ⇒ Water inventory and feasibility study commissioned by Ereto 1 is available in all villages for local water development planning. It is also available at PC, NCAA and Ereto offices.
- ⇒ Communities contributed toward the development of infrastructure in Phase 1 through labour, livestock and cash
- ⇒ Communities formally own water development infrastructure developed by Ereto 1
- ⇒ Some villages enacted by-laws regarding water and pasture management
- ⇒ Communities manage water delivery and infrastructure through water user committees
- ⇒ Communities maintain water works through their own resources
- ⇒ Communities are independently managing construction of new water developments schemes through funds collected from the community concerned (i.e. Endulen and Kakesio)

Limitations identified

The following limitations to the activities or incomplete activities were identified and recorded:

- ⇒ Wildlife have damaged water delivery infrastructure (pipelines and embankments)
- ⇒ Despite improvements bought about by the project, there remains a shortage of water for domestic and livestock use in the NCA
- ⇒ Wind driven pumps (in Kakesio and Njureta) are not functioning and not repaired, although committees and communities, as responsible entities, are there.

- ⇒ Sometimes the wrong people are identified for training in maintenance (e.g. someone who is already employed and who may not be available to mend the pipeline or pump)
- ⇒ Water in the shallow wells is too salty for human consumption (although good enough for calves)
- ⇒ Conflict of interests between NCAA - communities – Ereto may have been due to poor structures for communication (although this was improved to some extent through appointment of Liaison officer in NCAA)

Lessons learned on pastoralist water, pasture and natural resource management

- *Pastoralists are knowledgeable about how to manage water and pasture resources for livestock production*
- *Building on this knowledge will improve quality and sustainability of water delivery interventions, improve access to pasture, improve livestock production and reduce conflict*
- *Mobility within the grazing system is key to sustainable pastoralist production. Supporting mobility will reduce conflict and increase production (e.g. through support to CAHW, provision of strategic water resources etc)*
- *Pastoralists know how to live with wildlife. Building on this knowledge will reduce conflict and improve natural resources management*
- *There is still plenty of good pasture in NCA which is unutilized because there is no water in the pastures for livestock to use while grazing*

3.3 FINDINGS ON THE SUPPORT TO VETERINARY SERVICES COMPONENT

Achievements in the vet service component

Private veterinary practitioners operated throughout the NCA using the Livestock Development Centres (LDC) as bases for their business. Restocked families received vet services/drugs paid for by Ereto 1, and other livestock keepers paid the vet for services/drugs themselves. The LDCs were rehabilitated by NCAA and equipped by Ereto 1 with fridges, solar energy and short wave radio connection. Committees for managing the LDCs were established in each locality (ward) and crushes were built by Ereto 1. Spray pumps were distributed to restocking groups by Ereto 1, for spraying livestock with acaricides.

A survey of livestock diseases was undertaken by Veterinary Investigation Centre (VIC) and training provided to herders by the vets and others. Training on Contagious Bovine Pleuropneumonia (CBPP) was provided by Ereto to committees and vets (private practitioners and NCAA vets). Communities identified Community Animal Health Workers (CAHW) for training

Impact of Ereto 1 support to private vet service delivery in NCA

- ⇒ East Coast Fever (ECF) immunisation was introduced and is effective
- ⇒ The impact of livestock disease was reduced in NCA
- ⇒ Community awareness on use of vet services and drugs was increased
- ⇒ CAHW trained
- ⇒ Poverty burdens in the community reduced while the private vets were operating
- ⇒ CAHW are effective in treating pastoralist livestock
- ⇒ Pastoralists learned scientific explanations of livestock diseases

Limitations identified by the workshop

The following limitations to the activities or incomplete activities, were identified and recorded:

- ⇒ Conflict of interests between private vet service provision and public/state sector (as NCAA and Local Government Authority employed vets still operate in the area providing private vet services)
- ⇒ Refrigeration storage facilities for vet drugs were removed from LDCs by the staff of the second phase of Ereto (Ereto 2) and sold, without consultation with communities or the responsible committees.
- ⇒ Pastoralist still do not have skills on correct doses when treating own animals
- ⇒ Vet services did not build on local knowledge of livestock disease and treatment
- ⇒ CAHW trained by Ereto 1 were not utilised after the end of Ereto 1
- ⇒ Spray pumps promoted by Ereto 1 were not as effective as dipping livestock
- ⇒ Ereto 1 did not effectively monitor the private vet service delivery

Lessons on veterinary service delivery to pastoralists

Based on the above discussions and analysis the following lessons about how to improve livestock health and disease treatment in pastoralist areas were identified:

- *Pastoralists are knowledgeable about livestock diseases and have strategies for disease treatment and avoidance*
- *Pastoralists are quick to learn about veterinary treatment of livestock and drug administration*
- *If good quality drugs are available, pastoralists are prepared to purchase them*
- *It is necessary to avoid monopoly and encourage competition for the provision of vet drugs to pastoralists*

- *Private vet services are not economically viable where public service veterinary agents are competing by providing private vet service delivery*
- *Conflict of interests arise as state employed veterinarians are supposed to grant licences for private vets to operate and also to oversee the quality of all vet service delivery, yet the state employed vet operates as a private vet himself.*
- *Community based animal health workers provide effective vet service delivery to pastoralists, as they are part of the community, are always available and are knowledgeable about indigenous practices*

3.4 FINDINGS ON STRENGTHENING LOCAL INSTITUTIONS AND EMPOWERING COMMUNITIES

Ereto 1 achievements in strengthening institutions and communities

Restocking was managed by Ewoloto Committees, and water interventions were managed by Water User Committees. Livestock Health Committees were also established to manage and oversee private health service and LDCs. Quarterly Information Sharing Workshops (ISW), attended by Ereto and Ewoloto Committees, some members of the Ilaigwanak, PC and NCAA, were used to plan for and monitor project interventions during Ereto 1. In addition, ISW allowed community members to meet on a regular basis and discuss their won community issues.

PC was twice provided with training on leadership skills at TCDC. Technical training was provided to committees (water and livestock health) on relevant skills. Workshops were held for community members (PC, ISW) on various issues of concern (water development, veterinary service delivery, ticks, vet diseases, gender, HIV/AIDS, land and human rights). PLA training was provided for Ereto staff, community members and other actors, to improve learning and communication between communities and the project.

Impact of Ereto 1 efforts of strengthening institutions and empowering communities

- ⇒ Leadership strengthened through ewoloto (restocking) processes
- ⇒ Leadership training carried out
- ⇒ PC empowered to some extent (when seen as a continuing process)
- ⇒ Customary leadership strengthened through working with customary poverty alleviation and strategic water development
- ⇒ Relations with NCAA established
- ⇒ PC and Ilaigwanak represented on the project Steering Committee

- ⇒ Communities participated in decision making and monitoring through ISW and through consultation regarding all project processes (including reviews, phase 2 planning etc)
- ⇒ Communities were empowered through development and monitoring of water user committees
- ⇒ ISW was appreciated as informative for all areas and localities
- ⇒ Gender emerged as an area for special attention
- ⇒ Women started to find a 'voice' in public for a and decision making (including ewoloto committees, water user committees and ISW)
- ⇒ Community based animal health workers trained

Limitations identified by the workshop

The following limitations to empowering communities and strengthening local institutions were identified and recorded by the workshop:

- ⇒ Some training was carried out in an un-planned manner (e.g. for CAHWs)
- ⇒ Although women for the first time effectively participated in planning for and implementing development activities, women's participation was limited
- ⇒ Very few local women qualified for employment in Ereto 1 (only one female field staff)
- ⇒ As NCAA pastoralists became empowered to manage their own development, conflict arose around the delivery of services, with both the PC and NCAA
- ⇒ The PC is not an independent organisation, but relies completely on NCAA and is controlled by NCAA as it is created within the framework of NCAA
- ⇒ The aim of Ereto 1 to support civil society organisations such as Ngorongoro Pastoralist Association and other NGOs failed due to political interference
- ⇒ Relations between Ereto 1 and NCAA were not smooth.

Lessons on strengthening pastoralist institutions/communities

Based on the above discussions and analysis the following lessons about how to strengthen pastoralist institutions and empower communities and women were identified:

- *Meaningful and effective participation is essential for sustainable and equitable poverty reduction*
- *Formal training is only one route to empowerment - and not always successful. Often on job training about practical issues (water, livestock disease, accounting etc), joint planning sessions at community level with mutually agreed benchmarks, requirement for local monitoring and reporting of project activities, and open dialogue and coaching are the most effective community empowerment tools*

- *Supporting customary poverty alleviation mechanisms has far reaching positive impacts on communities and local institutions*
- *Fulfilling promises creates trust*
- *Information sharing increases knowledge and awareness*
- *Commitment and meaningful follow up from all stakeholders is necessary for sustainable impact of interventions*
- *Consensus building is the foundation of democracy in pastoralist society. This has to be supported through dialogue and inclusiveness*
- *NGOs/CSOs have difficulties operating in NCA*
- *In order for Ereto to provide meaningful support to PC, it needs to become a truly independent and representative non-government organisation*

The workshop acknowledged gender as a cross-cutting issue and identified important lessons and impacts from Phase 1

- *Pastoralists support effective participation of women in Ereto 1 (development)*
- *Women are empowered through re-stocking*
- *Changes in customary livestock ownership may result from project interventions*
- *Pastoralist men are able and willing to work with women in poverty reduction and other development activities*
- *Lack of educated pastoralist women who could be employed by the project constrains effective participation of women in project activities*

5. Closing of the workshop

The workshop was closed by Olaigwanani Naseya, who concluded wisely that:

'The most significant lesson from Ereto 1 was that participation is necessary for the success and sustainability of development interventions. Participation does not only include the beneficiaries, but also includes the wider society that surrounds and interacts with the beneficiaries.'

Naseya thanked all participants for contributing with enthusiasm, and challenged everyone to carry on the work of Ereto 1, building on the best practices and good lessons, and working to remove limitations. The workshop was blessed by the Olaigwanani in the Maasai way. The workshop closed at 18.00

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS OF WORKSHOP HELD IN ENDULEN ON 30TH MARCH 2005

1. Flora J. Patta – CPF Ereto 2, Olbalbal
2. Loserian Ole Madi – Nayobi
3. Solomon Lengaram – CPF Ereto 2, Nainukunuka
4. Matingoe Ole Tawuo – Olaigwenani
5. Ngobei Ole Rrunguna – Olaigwenani
6. Saiboku Kimirei- PFO Ereto 1
7. Saunya saiguran – Women’s representative
8. Nailogu Kurraa – Nayobi
9. Marine Kiroshi – “
10. Ole Muna Orrunya – Olaigwenani
11. Nginainai Siara – Olaigwenani
12. Oloitai Loontare – Olaigwenani Olbalbal
13. Metui Ole Shaudo PC Chairman
14. Sakita Papai – Olaigwenani Olbalbal
15. Naisula Maiko – Women Rep.
16. Emanuel Kotika – Ewoloto C’tee, Kakesio
17. Olesikai Sereb – Olaigwenani, Kakesio
18. Naalayiok Oleiti – Women rep, Kakesio
19. Noolamala Matunda – Women Rep. Endulen
20. James Moringe – CPF Endulen/Kakesio/Olpiro
21. Kodi Ralph Siara – Ereto 2 Planning & Finance Officer
22. Margaret Kaisoe – CPF Ereto 2, Oloirobi
23. Simon P. Loishie – Gender Comm. Dev. Coordinator (GCDC) Ereto 2
24. Lazaro Ole Kosyando – Field Assistant
25. Naomi Kipuri – Consultant
26. Carol Sorensen – Consultant
27. Parmitor Kasiaro – Village Chairman, Oloirobi
28. Miriam Ollemoita – Field Assistant
29. William Ole Nasea - Olaigwenani, Endulen
30. Emanuel Lomayiani – NCAA , Water Department
31. Samson Mkumbo – NCAA, Vet. Department
32. Meng’oru Ole Mbukoti – Olaigwenani, Misigiyio/Oloirobi
33. Victor Runyoro – Liaison Officer Ereto and NCAA
34. William Ole Seki – PC, Endulen
35. Peter Metele – P.C. Manager
36. Sanguyan Ole Dorrop – Translator
37. Lelian Maison – Endulen