

Draft 1

ERETO Ngorongoro Pastoralist Project
Review of Lessons Learned in Phase I
and
Issues to be Considered in Phase II

John Rowley

November 2002



Lion House, Ditchling Common Industrial Estate
Hassocks, West Sussex, BN6 8SL, England

Telephone: +44 1444 248088
Fax: +44 1444 248763
e-mail: mail@itad.com
Website: www.itad.com

SUMMARY

ERETO Phase I has had important effects on poverty reduction among the Maasai of the Ngorongoro Conservation Area in terms of restocking, access to water and animal health.

The project has developed positive relationships with communities and raised the competencies local committees and levels of trust between communities and outsiders. The communities are better able to lead development work because of the project work.

The project has achieved a way of working with the Ngorongoro Conservation Area Authority despite differences in approach and initial difficulties.

The project efforts have not achieved high levels of institutionalisation of the project initiatives at community level and sustainable continuation of activities is unlikely. The project has made efforts in the direction of institutionalisation but the time has been too short and sufficient attention has not been applied to achieve better success at this stage.

The institutionalisation of project work at the level of the Ngorongoro Conservation Area has been weak and there is no partner agency in a position to pursue the work that has been started. The institutional environment is not conducive to easy handover of activities; there is, for example, an almost complete absence of local NGOs that might take up different parts of project work.

More time will be required to achieve some level of sustainability of project work at both community and Area levels.

The project management has not been consistent enough to make the best out of opportunities at community level. Greater adherence to planning and better delegation of authority would have been necessary to empower project workers to follow through more effectively on initiatives.

The project has made a wide range of links to other actors in the area and some effective collaborations have been achieved. The nature and style of these links are probably not sustainable and are too closely associated with personal links rather than institutional needs.

Overall the first phase has achieved a great deal which needs to be consolidated by continued support and a shift towards a more sustainable empowering approach.

Readers should read the accompanying reports on HIV/AIDS and Institutional Options.

HIV/AIDS

The situation of HIV/AIDS is extremely alarming. There are many mechanisms that provide for transmission of the virus into communities in the NCA. There are many mechanisms that can provide for effective transmission within communities. Conventional mechanisms for reducing transmission are unlikely to be effective in their unmodified forms. There are huge levels of ignorance among the communities and almost no efforts being made towards education and awareness-raising. Levels of infection are probably about 6% and the levels must be expected to rise very rapidly over the next ten years if there are no changes in behaviour.

The project will be obliged to take a direct role in promoting HIV/AIDS awareness in any new phase. All the gains in the first Phase are out in jeopardy if nothing is done. Possession of knowledge of the situation constitutes an obligation to act.

Institutional Options

The institutional situation within NCA is very unusual and there are important questions about the representation of the people that should be examined by the key stakeholders in any future phase of project work.

The institutional environment is dominated by the presence of the NCAA and there is a dearth of middle level organisations between the communities and the Authority and weak links to the conventional government structures.

The issues for any future engagement are these:

- Whether the project should expand into the rest of Ngorongoro District and out of the NCA, and whether the project should continue with the same range of activities. What implications shall expansion into the rest of the district have for the structure of the project?
- Ministerial responsibility for the project within the government of Tanzania. Should the MNRT continue to be the responsible Ministry for the project within the government of Tanzania, or should the responsibility be transferred to a different Ministry altogether, or shared between this and another Ministry; and which Ministry should that be?
- Partnerships: whether the partnership with the PC within the NCA should continue, and if so, what form it should take. What new partnerships does the project need to develop in the next phase?
- Policy and strategic issues: what policy and strategic issues does the project need to involve itself with to support the livelihoods of the Ngorongoro Maasai? How can it manage such involvement consistently with its character as a bilateral programme?
- Sustainability: what should the project do to ensure the sustainability of its initiatives? In particular, what frameworks should it support within the project area to take over the management of project activities at the end of the project?

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Introduction	6
Background to the study	6
Purpose of the study	6
2. Observations	7
Restocking	7
Water Development	11
Land and resource issues	12
Environment	13
Capacity Building	13
Trust	16
Markets and small-scale enterprise	16
Provision of veterinary services	17
Gender Approach	20
Institutional Linkages and partnerships	21
Coherence of activities	23
3. Findings and Lessons	23
Poverty Reduction	23
Consistency of management	24
Approach and Priorities	24
4. Recommendations	25
Recommendations to ERETO project staff	25
Recommendations to the Joint Review Team	26

ABBREVIATIONS

AHA	Animal Health Assistant
AU-IBAR	African Union - Inter-African Bureau for Animal Resources
CAHW	Community Animal Health Worker
CBAHW	Community-Based Animal Health Worker
CBPP	Contagious Bovine Pleuro-Pneumonia
DFID	Department for International Development (UK)
ECF	East Coast Fever
Ewoloto	Traditional method of restocking
FZS	Frankfurt Zoological Society
GPS	Global Positioning System
ISW	Information Sharing Workshop
LADO	Laramatak Development Organisation
LFA	Logical Framework Analysis
NCAA	Ngorongoro Conservation Area Authority
NCA	Ngorongoro Conservation Area
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NPA	Ngorongoro Pastoralist Association
OIDA	Oseremi Integral Development Association
PC	Pastoral Council
PFO	Project Field Officer
PINGOS	Networking organisation for pastoral NGOs
PIP	Project Implementation Plan
PLA	Participatory Learning and Action
PPA	Participatory Poverty Assessment
PVP	Private Veterinary Professional
RPT	Review Preparation Team
RWA	Consultancy organisation - UK
SC	Steering Committee
TCDC	Training centre near Moshi.
TPHGO	Tanzania Pastoralist and Hunter Gatherer Organisation
TTBDCP	Tick and Tick-Borne Disease Control Project
TZS	Tanzanian Shilling
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
VIC	Veterinary Information Centre, Arusha
VSF	Vétérinaires sans Frontières
WEGS	Water Environment and Groundwater Survey

1. INTRODUCTION

Background to the study

1.1. The ERETO Ngorongoro Pastoralist Project became operational in 1998 and is nearing the end of its first phase¹ and will be reviewed formally in early 2003. The first phase will come to an end in July 2003 and it is with credible foresight that this study and review are being planned so far in advance.

1.2. This study forms part of the preparations for the Joint Review of the Ereto project that will take place in January 2003. There are essentially three separate preparatory exercises:

1. Lessons Learned Study,
2. Identification of Issues for future planning, and,
3. Draft of an Indicative project document.

1.3. The lessons learned study is the retrospective part of the preparations and sets out to identify the key lessons learned, both positive and negative, of the first two phases of the Ereto NPP. The Terms of Reference specify a number of areas for the study which include:

- Poverty reduction
- Strengthening community capacity for self management
- Institutional linkages and partnership
- Markets and small-scale economic production
- Water development
- Land and resources issues
- Provision of vet services.

1.4. The preparations for the review also include prospective studies of issues that would need to be taken into consideration in any new phases of project work. The three Issues studies are: HIV/AIDS, institutional arrangements and livestock potential. These studies will help to inform design and planning of any new project work.

1.5. The Indicative Project Document is to be drafted as a tool to advance the thinking of the Joint Review team by providing a model project document that can be analysed and modified.

Purpose of the study

1.6. The study has a broad remit and is intended to highlight strengths and weaknesses in approaches and methods rather than identify impacts. It is expected that impact assessment will be a part of the Joint Review process.

1.7. The Terms of Reference make it clear that the study should focus on "*the experience of the project in addressing issues and the approach and priorities of project work. The study will attempt to capture learning that may be outside formal project*

¹ There is some potential for confusion over the numbering of phases. The Project Implementation Plan for 2001-2003 is called Phase II but the accepted naming now is that those years were part of Phase I (1998-2003) and any new project starting in 2003 will be the real Phase II.

sectors.” The study will therefore bring together observations on project performance and also highlight questions that the Joint Review might choose to address.

2. OBSERVATIONS

Restocking

2.1. The restocking work represents the largest commitment of staff time and project resources. The budgeted figures show that restocking would account for DKK11.5M out of a project total of about DKK30M. Water development is also financially important at about DKK9.5M but appears to require less staff time in implementation.²

2.2. The project figures are that a total of 13,056 heifers and 12,876 shoats have been distributed to a total of 3,236 people between the start of the restocking in 1999 and the end of 2002. It was planned that a total of 3,400 families should receive animals under the scheme. At the time of writing (October 2002) 656 heifers and 3,015 goats remain to be distributed to the remaining 164 recipients. The impact on total livestock numbers in the area is likely to be slight and may be equivalent to about 7% of the NCA herd.

2.3. Rumours about the negative effects of restocking have been circulating including the dangers of importing new diseases to the area and importing cattle that are unable to survive in the climatic conditions of the area. Most of these rumours appear to be untrue and mortality among ewoloto animals is comparable with that of the existing herd according to the people on ewoloto committees interviewed by the Review Preparation Team. The ERETO project should be in a position to confirm this picture with their own data.

2.4. The restocking has been a very considerable investment. There are two essential additions to the restocking which are the provision of free veterinary assistance for two years and free distributions of maize for three years to the families. These inputs are provided so that the destitute families can re-enter pastoralist production and not be under undue pressure to sell livestock in order to survive in the short-term. The logic is faultless but has put other elements of the project under intense pressure.

Revitalisation of ewoloto

2.5. There is a growing body of opinion that the restocking has “revitalised” the ewoloto system. In fact, in many communities the practice has been continuous up to and through the lifetime of the project. Potkanski³ reports on the “death” of ewoloto in some communities and suggests that the practice is more vulnerable among communities that are practicing more arable farming. Even where the practice had died, Potkanski reports that the ideas and principles remained intact. The traditional system is restricted to restocking within clans and had reached very small proportions because of the increased poverty and lack of available animals for restocking.

2.6. The project methods of restocking are somewhat different from the traditional methods in that the project can allow restocking across clan lines although it is unclear

² This is based on testimony of ERETO staff who do not routinely report on their use of time against different project objectives.

³ Pastoral Economy, Property rights and Traditional Mutual Assistance Mechanisms among the Ngorongoro and Salei Maasai of Tanzania. Pastoral Land tenure Series Monograph 2, Tomasz Potkanski, IIED, 1997.

how prevalent this has been. The project ewoloto also provides the free veterinary and food inputs mentioned above. The project system has also brought about the creation of ewoloto committees and these bodies are held responsible for the good management of the distribution of animals within the community. The committees are a new institution brought about through prolonged contact and discussion between the communities and the project. The sustainability of these committees is an issue for the Joint Review.

Impacts in terms of survival and well-being

2.7. The universal praise of the restocking from the communities makes it hard to find fault with the activity. There are also good reasons to believe that the praise is genuine and based on real impact. The project collects data on survival and reproduction of the ewoloto herd but these were not seen by the review preparation team. The data will be more useful if they can be compared with similar observations on the existing herd in the area. The project could also collect highly reliable observations of impact using PLA techniques but so far this has not been done in any systematic way.

2.8. In addition to the calculated effects of the receipt of animals and grain are casual observations of impact that the project could also collect. The absence of beggars in Endulen and the fact that people no longer sweep up the spillage at the maize mill are offered as observations of improvements in standards of living. Given the problems caused by the drought in 2000 one could expect such symptoms of destitution to be continuing.

2.9. It is important to remember that the restocking took place over a period that included one of the worst droughts of the last thirty years for the area. The impacts of the restocking need to be compared with the situation that would have occurred without the project interventions and not with the situation before the project interventions. The RWA report to DFID suggests that livestock numbers would take between three and six years to return to pre-drought numbers with the support of animal health services⁴. The restocking programme of ERETO has significantly reduced what the recovery time would have been and the period of suffering for animal keepers has been dramatically shortened.

The unmatched

2.10. One criticism from the communities of the restocking is that it has not reached the very poorest of the community who have not received animals from other members of their family or clan. People may not be offered animals for restocking if they are considered unable to manage correctly the animals that they would receive. Such people remain welfare cases in their community and are, to a certain extent, cared for by their communities. They may benefit indirectly from other members of the community being better off both through handouts and by a reduction in competition with other poor people who are now better off.

2.11. There is a second group of unmatched people who are considered by the community to be deserving of support but who cannot be matched because their own

⁴ The variation depends upon the species concerned and recovery is much slower without veterinary inputs. DFID, Pastoral Livelihoods: Programme Appraisal, Final Report, Animal Health Service Delivery in Pastoral Areas of the Greater Horn of Africa, RWA International.

family and clan network cannot afford to allocate animals to them. The project receives many requests for continued restocking to these people and the issue should be addressed by the Joint Review.

Return to pastoralist livelihood

2.12. The project approach has been that the restocking should enable the recipients to re-enter or continue in the pastoralist livelihood. The animals distributed should create a viable herd for the family unit and enable them to survive without other forms of support after the project inputs have been received.

2.13. Smaller inputs might be helpful even if they do not allow the recipients to create a viable herd. It should be put to the test with the communities allowed to allocate resources according to their own design. Such flexibility appears to be denied the project by the commitment to a particular number of target people. There appears to be a strong budget-led focus on completion of activities.

Impacts on ECF control

2.14. One unintended impact of the ewoloto distributions has been a change in the practice of ECF vaccination. The project carried out demonstrations of ECF vaccination in each ward but many observers comment that the survival of the ewoloto animals was crucial to convincing people of the effectiveness of the treatment. Since ECF was the most important source of mortality among cattle this impact should not be underestimated. The provision of ECF vaccination is also likely to be a key element in making veterinary services profitable, so the impact is broader than simple disease control.

Impacts on social well-being

2.15. Project assessments of impact of restocking focus on material well-being but interviews with community members⁵ indicate a more immediate social impact. It is suggested that people who have been restocked are more able to take a more important and meaningful role in their community. This observation is supported by the community reports on impact in the Information Sharing Workshops. Although Potkanski reports that losing ones animals in Maasai society does not make one "*socially poor*" the reverse seems to be true and regaining animals does make one more socially rich.

Pressure on vet services

2.16. The provision of free vet inputs through ewoloto has put strain on the provision of vet services more generally to the community. The provision of free drugs and services at the same time as drugs and services at market rates was always likely to cause difficulties and provide opportunities and temptation for corruption. In fact, a great deal of the difficulties in vet provision encountered by the project can be seen to have their roots in the provision of free services to the ewoloto families. (See paragraph 2.72)

Pressure on relations with NCAA

2.17. The provision of maize distributions has been a continuous source of conflict between Ereto and the NCAA. The NCAA has been inefficient at providing the maize. During the year 2001, the NCAA made five deliveries of maize totalling 16,000 bags

⁵ Report on a Fourth Training in PLA December 2001, John Rowley, January 2002. (page 9).

which allowed the deficit between planned and actual deliveries to increase from 2,540 to 4,683 bags. This constitutes a real failing in the fulfilment of the practical and contractual obligations of the Authority. Since the provision of maize is a major part of the contribution of the Government of Tanzania the failure also attracts the criticism of showing lack of support to the project.

2.18. The failing has been a major bone of contention between Ereto and the NCAA and has occupied a major part of the Steering Committee time and attention. However, inefficient government services are common across the globe and should not come as much of a surprise. I am not suggesting that the project should ignore the failings and it is clearly right to insist routinely on the satisfaction of contractual agreements. But I do think that the failures should not have been developed into continual complaints against the NCAA.

Pressure on staff time

2.19. The restocking has occupied an inordinate amount of staff time. Sometimes three executive members of staff (and presumably drivers) are involved in the purchase, vaccination and in setting up the trekking of the animals over a number of days. Whilst this kind of staff investment was probably necessary in the first rounds of purchases, it seems hard to justify the continued use of staff time. Not only because it is expensive but also because it denies the communities the possibilities of taking over the roles themselves.

Issues in the Approach

2.20. The use of ewoloto committees appears to have been successful despite the apparent imposition of some elements of the approach. The process was as democratic as reasonably possible and the project tried to be very inclusive. The proposals by the ewoloto committees are checked by the PC and by the project and Information Sharing Workshops (ISW) are used to agree on priorities for communities to be supported. It is hard to see how the project could have made the progress that it has made without insisting on some structure to relate to in the distribution of animals. However, the committees could have been more effectively empowered to take control of the purchase, vaccination and trekking of the animals. Nevertheless, there is an important realisation among community members that were interviewed that the process has led to some capacity building and the committees are described as being able to carry out restocking without the assistance of project staff.

2.21. The communities were, after all, entrusted with the final distribution to families of both animals and maize where the potential for misuse could be high. If the communities could be trusted with the final stages of the restocking they might have been trusted to carry out more of the process in earlier stages. The lesson appears to be that the project was remaining in a hands-on role after it would have been possible and desirable to stand back and transfer more responsibility to the ewoloto committees. This is still possible before the end of the project Phase II.

2.22. The much-repeated request to examine the principles of the ewoloto distributions appears not to have been followed through. The communities appear not to know if the project would accept to restock the unmatched poor or whether the project would accept to restock at levels below that of the viable herd. Both questions could be addressed by handing over the process to the communities so that they could make these decisions.

Water Development

2.23. The work in water provision has been a huge investment for the project and has covered a wide range of initiatives across the whole NCA. The relevance of the work is not in question and the results have been widely appreciated.

Water committees

2.24. The project engaged in discussions with community leaders at some length before agreements were reached on the creation of new institutions for the reception of the inputs and again this seems to have been successful despite the some imposition of the approach.⁶ Water management appears to relate to clan or family ownership of certain types of water sources and to common ownership of other, usually larger, sources. The concept of a water committee appears redundant except where it relates to the management of new equipment that requires specialist knowledge or management. For example, management of pumps and taps and wind-power devices requires some specialist skills which means that individuals have to be trained in maintenance and provision of spare parts. Protection of dam walls and spillways may also require assignment of responsibility to individuals. The trained individuals need to be responsible to the community and this is achieved by them being answerable to the water committee.

2.25. It is not clear how the water committees will manage the more complex machinery; those questioned appear not to have collected any funds with which to purchase the spare parts that will inevitably become necessary. There is far less willingness, among those interviewed, to describe the water committees as capable of continued work compared with the responses to similar questions about the ewoloto committees. In fact, the success seems to be rather patchy with some committees working well and others being sidelined by existing systems which are more powerful.

Collaboration between consultants, communities and contractors

2.26. The project has engaged WEGS as in-house consultants so as to have “expert technical advice on hand.” The major water works are put out to tender and contractors are hired against their tenders. The local communities are obliged to provide unskilled labour for some tasks and, for example, plant grass to stabilise earth banks on some dam constructions. The first phase of the project failed to find a way of collecting cash contributions from communities for water developments. It is not clear why since communities do make cash contributions (according to a sliding scale of their own invention) to such initiatives as new school buildings. The contributions in kind of the communities are variable and there are some developments where no appropriate community contribution can be levied.

Engagement with NCAA

2.27. The project has collaborated with the NCAA in a number of areas of the work on water provision.

- NCAA staff were involved in discussions with a consultant engineer during the design of the water component,
- NCAA advised on tendering of water works,

⁶ “A pre-requisite stipulated by the project is that each water development must have a water association responsible for the intervention.” PIP Phase II, p35.

- In later stages EIAs were carried out by NCAA on new water developments,
 - Some road clearing has been done by NCAA on approaches to work sites.
- NCAA machinery was not made available for project work on the grounds that the government approach was to promote private enterprise in the sector and because the machinery was already fully occupied.

2.28. The PIP says that water policy will be prepared “in *close collaboration with the communities and their leaders, the various relevant departments of the NCAA (and) the District and Regional water engineers.*” In fact, it appears that the community side of the work has been addressed effectively whilst the institutional side has not been so effective and engagements with NCAA and District level are not at a level that would encourage optimism about sustainability.

2.29. The project looks spendthrift in contrast to the villagers who developed the Mokilal dam in Oloirobi for a fraction of the cost of similar project interventions by persuading NCAA to provide a bulldozer and driver and paying simply for the fuel. Project staff believe that they could not follow the same procedures which would result in a construction of lower quality (unsecured dam wall, no spillway, ...etc.) and in any case could not make use NCAA machinery. The population is not aware that the project is under these constraints and accusations of profligacy may continue.

Issues in the Approach

2.30. The effectiveness of the provision of water has been shown to be very high. Impacts are reported in increases of volume of water available, time saved by women, changed animal movements, and improvements to working of school and health clinic. People are also changing their practices in relation to the provision of water through the new water points.

2.31. The approach in water development has been a mixture of effective participatory planning and imposed measures that are hard to evaluate. The work has been costly but given an inability to collaborate with the NCAA the costs have been reasonable. The project could do more to monitor the impacts of the water provision and the functioning of the water committees. This would inform the design of future engagements.

Land and resource issues

2.32. Land and range management are not treated by the project as a separate area of activity. The development of water sources in some cases makes the use of pasture more efficient and might allow fewer stock movements but the range is not considered as an element different from the development of the water point. The more recent introduction of EIA for such water developments should consider the impact on pasture and the movements of people that result from the improved availability of water.

2.33. The use of PLA methods has provided a starting point for land use planning since the mapping work constitute a description of current land use around villages. The maps produced by the communities can be compared with conventional maps by the use of GPS marking of features on the community maps. These techniques have not been developed into village land use plans. A key area of concern for the project would have been the extent of cultivation around villages which is clearly shown on some community maps. The area under cultivation is a very contentious issue and the

project might have been in a position to contribute to the debate on cultivation and perhaps explore the impact on cultivation of improved animal health. In theory, better animal health would lead to less cultivation and observations of this process have been made outside the NCA⁷.

2.34. The Village Land Act provides a powerful new legal tool for the registration of people's rights to determine the use of land around their village. Inside the NCA this legal instrument has not been put to the test. Land tenure is a key area of difficulty for herders generally and for those in the NCA it is a particularly sensitive and important area for future work. Relatively little has been possible in the first Phase of the project although it is clearly recognised as important. A training event was held in Arusha for community leaders from the NCA and PC members on questions of land tenure and a few NCAA staff attended. Attempts to follow through with this training in the Ngorongoro were not successful and no new initiatives were made in this area of work.

Environment

2.35. EIAs are now insisted upon for all new water developments and the potential embarrassment of the work near the Laitoli footprint has served as an important reminder of the importance of such assessments prior to commencement of work.

2.36. The environment is a potential area for conflict with the NCAA and the area is made more difficult because of the absence of reliable universally respected data about the area. This may seem odd for one of the most studied areas of Africa but it seems true that no one is able to express clear unchallenged views on the environmental changes that are taking place. The changes in human numbers, livestock numbers, wildlife and cultivation all seem to be matters of extreme importance to all the actors in NCA but indisputable observations of changes and indisputable assessments of the impact of changes seem impossible to find.

Capacity Building

2.37. The Project Implementation Plan for Phase II describes capacity building of local institutions as the key to the second phase of the project. Capacity building is a constant theme although the phrase is rarely used:

- *“Development efforts that contribute to strengthening traditional and community based institutions constitute an important step to creating a self-managing society” (p10).*
- *“PC must be strengthened as much as possible (p16)*
- *Maasai institutions must be strengthened The project strategy is to strengthen those institutions through the greatest possible participation ...in project activities and through... training”. (p17)*
- *“The focus of Phase 2 is on building the capacity of communities and their leaders to take charge of their own situation” (p 35)*

Pastoral Council

2.38. The assessment of the collaboration with the PC in the first three years is described⁸ as *“very successful”* but this appears to be something of an overstatement.

⁷ Di Guilio, pers comm..

⁸ Ereto - Ngorongoro Pastoralist Project, Project Implementation Plan Phase II, 01.01.2001 to 30.06.2003. Prepared by PIU, Ereto-NPP.

Indeed in the report of strengthening of the PC⁹ there are fifteen activities mentioned but only three relate to the PC and all concern training. Support to the PC included:

- The PC was provided with training in leadership at TCDC (10 days),
- Land and Human Rights training event in Arusha (1 day),
- Logical Framework Analysis and project planning (1 day),
- PC secretary was given training in project management,
- PC chair was given language training in English (3 weeks).

2.39. The training at TCDC was repeated after significant changes in the make up of the PC. The second training event was not perceived as successful. The PC members that we spoke to found the training to be largely useless despite politely thanking the project for the training in their first answers to questions about the experience. One member said that the training was like being asked to go and collect an empty bag. Indeed the range of educational level and experience in the PC make it seem unlikely that a training course could be designed that would be appropriate to all the members. Other forms of support should perhaps have been considered and might have been if the project had adopted a more positive attitude to the institution of the PC.

2.40. Support to the PC has not been pursued with enthusiasm during the later part of the first phase. The project position seems to have been that the PC was not capable of representing the views of the people to the NCAA and therefore strengthening the PC was not a helpful or positive thing to do.

2.41. There were opportunities for the project to provide practical support. The Steering Committee minutes suggest that the project was repeatedly asked to provide office space for the PC but the project declined. In fact, there are difficulties with accommodation and it is not obvious that the PC staff could have been easily found space. However, there are many buildings that might have been used to find space and these possibilities were not examined with serious enthusiasm.

NCAA

2.42. The PIP speaks of “a need to co-ordinate activities with the NCAA ... (to achieve) a long-term goal of a higher level of integration of activities and strategies. There is a clear need for sensitisation of staff on these issues”. It is not immediately obvious if the staff referred to is that of the NCAA or ERETO but it clearly applies to both and, in fact, neither has been adequately addressed.

2.43. Support to the NCAA has included:

- Training in control of CBPP¹⁰,
- PLA training,
- AU-IBAR private veterinary support,
- Participation in the Information Sharing Workshops,
- A workshop in Land Rights in Arusha,
- A workshop in Gender in Ngorongoro,
- Ticks and Tick-Borne diseases,
- Water developments.

⁹ PIP Phase II (p5).

¹⁰ In fact, the CBPP control training was also provided to communities, ewoloto committees, PC members, veterinary officers and the project field officers.

In most cases participation was limited in numbers of participants and duration. The project organised the workshops or training inputs for the project staff and other beneficiaries and invited NCAA staff to attend.

2.44. The project has made good use of the Information Sharing Workshops to discuss all areas of its work, monitoring and evaluation and to share decision-making in veterinary support, water developments and restocking. Its attempts to be transparent have not been fully appreciated or reciprocated. The attitudes of project staff are not positive towards the NCAA and the two agencies have come to occupy adversarial positions from which it is difficult to generate positive engagements.

2.45. It is to the credit of the project that a position of accommodation with the NCAA has been achieved and an acceptable mode of working has been found. The appointment of a liaison officer within the NCAA has improved communication. A great deal more needs to be done to reach a position of effective partnership.

Communities

2.46. Communities identified volunteers to be trained in animal health in Simanjiro and 18 trainees finished the course which took three years. The trained individuals are now back with their communities but in the cases of those spoken to by the Review Preparation Team they do not have work. Some community members explained that they had hoped that the trainees would continue their training at Tengeru but that the project had not been able to support these additional inputs¹¹. The initial design of the training input seems not to have been completely thought through.

ERETO Staff

2.47. ERETO staff have received training in a range of subjects: gender, PLA, Training of Trainers and have profited from training additions to consultancies in topics like Logical Framework Analysis. English language training has been provided and the Finance Officer has specifically received training for the Certificate in Public Accounting.

2.48. The Private Veterinary Professionals and Animal Health Assistants have received regular formal and informal training by veterinary consultants, the staff of Veterinary Information Centre (VIC), staff of the Tick and Tick-Borne Disease Control Project and AU-IBAR.

Ewoloto and Water committees

2.49. The committees formed by the project at community level have received support from the project staff, most importantly from Project Field Officers. Specific technical training was provided to members of the water committees who had responsibilities for upkeep and maintenance of installations. Guidance in management of water points was also planned. The water association that would become responsible for the Nainokanoka pipeline was to receive "*training in simple bookkeeping, reporting and democratic processes*".

Comments on the approach

¹¹ In fact, the project would have found it difficult to provide such support which was not anticipated in the original project budget. It is to be hoped that the second phase will have greater flexibility to take up good ideas which cannot be anticipated as they appear.

2.50. The capacity building approach of the project has shown too great a dependence on training. In many cases the training has been in the form of short courses either from local training centres or from visiting trainers. The project has not formed the continuous engagement with recipients of capacity building that would have allowed a more sustained coaching approach. The PC is a special case where coaching would have been possible if the project had provided office space so that contact could have been continuous and coaching in, say, maintaining accounts could have been provided.

Trust

2.51. The building of trust between the community and the project has not formally been defined as a project objective but perhaps it should have been. The problem statement of the project includes lack of trust as a limiting factor. A number of project initiatives have also mentioned the history of broken promises as a potential problem for project work.

2.52. The project approach appears to have been successful in building a certain degree of trust that was not present at the start of project work. A number of interviewees telling the story of project interventions commented on how they did not, at certain stages, know what to think since they suspected the project words; saying, for example, *"We did not believe it; like NCAA promises"*.

2.53. I asked interviewees how they would do better another time in collaboration with the project and how they would advise other communities starting to work with the project. In several cases, the answer to both questions was that they should invest more of their own contributions earlier in the joint enterprise. It is hard to interpret this in any other way but that the experience of working with ERETO had increased the ability to trust external agencies. The interviews also included similar remarks about how relationships with the project had increased a sense of being able to achieve change although in most cases the remarks did not relate to particular events and probing did not reveal what the increased ability was or how it had been brought about.

2.54. The long trail of broken promises in recent Maasai history in the area and the tiny change in experience that the project represents are reasons to continue the project into new phases. At the very least the project must complete all the promises that have been made in restocking and water provision. It would be a tragedy to have raised a certain level of trust only to let it fail and provide even more evidence that outsiders are not to be trusted.

2.55. It is important to note the observation that building trust with the communities was prioritised over making more important efforts to work better with the NCAA and also the PC. The adversarial nature of politics in the area means that it is sometimes very difficult to appear neutral or even-handed. Working with any group even where there is a very clear perceived need may well be interpreted as taking sides.¹²

Markets and small-scale enterprise

2.56. The exploration of income generating activities is an important part of a long-term strategy for the people of the NCA. It seems reasonable to imagine that increased

¹² The team were told jokingly that to drink water in the NCA is not seen as the simple act of quenching thirst but is always examined for political motives!

human population and decreased opportunities in pastoralism and arable production will mean that many more people will be required to add alternative means of income generation to their livelihood systems.

2.57. The gender study carried out by local consultants advised that a survey of viable business opportunities should be carried out and the project commissioned a study from an NGO in Arusha on the possible economic activities in the area. The study had just been completed at the time of this study and a workshop to review the results is planned for the near future.

2.58. The relative lack of progress may be due to the weak gender approach in the first phases of the project in which most attention has been focused on restocking and animal health.

Provision of veterinary services

2.59. The Review Preparation Team has only met enthusiastic support for veterinary inputs from the communities that have been visited. There is no doubt that the inputs are relevant and very highly appreciated and there is evidence of impact in terms of animal health and people's understanding of animal health problems and care.

2.60. Nevertheless, the provision of veterinary support is perhaps the most contentious area of project activity and one where sustainable outputs are most unclear.

2.61. The initial approach through the support to two Private Veterinary Practitioners who each worked through three Animal Health Assistants was damaged when one of the PVPs was forced to resign from the project and return to his post as District Veterinary Officer. The loss of one of the PVPs was handled in such a way that bad feelings still remain and the loss has not been made good despite the project approach requiring two vets to cover the six wards.

2.62. The selection of AHAs has been heavily criticised mostly because the people concerned are described as not being from the areas in which they serve and have therefore limited commitment to providing a service and work instead mostly for the potential financial rewards. The selection and employment was managed by the PVPs but the weakness is still attributed to the project!

2.63. Professional inputs have been provided from VIC, the TTBDGP and private consultants. Training has been provided in formal and informal mechanisms to the PVPs and the AHAs by all the professionals mentioned. It is worth remembering, as pointed out by staff at the VIC, that vets are not necessarily trainers. The project disposes a vast amount of information about animal health conditions in the NCA. These data may continue to be used as a valuable resource in monitoring changes in animal health problems.

2.64. The training provided by the project through Simanjiro as noted above, does not seem to be linked into the mechanisms for veterinary support provision.

2.65. The AHA approach has also been criticised and an approach through Community Animal Health Works (CAHWs) is now described as the preferred model. The CAHW approach has been stalled for some time although it is recommended during Phase I of the project. Part of the reason for this is that new legislation is being drafted

and that the project would want to conform to the new legal situation. In fact, many other agencies are pursuing CAHW programmes and waiting for the law to become clear is not a convincing reason for not making more efforts in this direction. The Review Preparation Team, can however, sympathise with the view that over-worked project staff might see the delay as a relief.

2.66. Although there are a number of different models of CAHW that the project could follow the commitment to a participatory approach should allow the design of a model by the project and the communities at the same time. It is therefore, somewhat presumptuous of the project to determine in advance exactly how many CAHWs there should be and what the gender mix should be. The project is obliged to follow this somewhat predetermined path by the budget-led manner of project formulation. The use of the ISW to set numbers and determine the gender of CAHWs may reflect the needs and ambitions of the different communities but it is possibly better for each community to make its own choices. The selection of the candidate CAHW is, according to those interviewed by the RPT, the key to how well the approach will work. The project needs to check on the choice of individuals and perhaps avoid predetermining the selection.

Privatisation

2.67. The national policy on the privatisation of veterinary services appears not to lead to any particular model of privatised services. The simple statement that the state should reduce its direct involvement does not help identify the style of private and public collaboration that is preferred. Some public services will need to continue such as data collection and management of epidemics but is not clear where such services would end and how they would relate to private provision.

2.68. In fact, the government's overall lack of vision for livestock production along pastoralist lines is a threat to the livelihoods of pastoralists. Our discussions with officials in Ngorongoro district produced a wide range of ideas of how the state should be involved in animal health work and a wide range of interpretation of what constitutes a state subsidy. There appears to be no support for radical privatisation but instead a belief that the idea of privatisation is a donor imposition that is neither appropriate nor workable in pastoralist production.

2.69. Clearly the approach of the project should be seen to conform to national policy but could also provide a challenge to policy interpretation where good data are collected on the use and impact of veterinary services.

2.70. The project documents identify a number of serious risks to the veterinary component of the project work and one is continuous competition between the PVPs and government vets who may provide services at subsidised prices by the illegal use of government or donated drugs. There is evidence that illegal practices are continuing in areas where there is an important market for veterinary inputs.

2.71. The fifteen NCAA vet assistants are also a potential cause for concern since they have very limited roles under the new privatisation policy but retain the ability to intervene in the sales of veterinary services although this would be against government policy. One would expect the number of NCAA vets to be reduced in line with the reduced needs and NCAA interviewees suggested that this might be allowed to happen through "natural wastage". In the meantime, the threat remains although in a genuinely

privatised situation a PVP and their CAHWs need to be able to compete with other providers so the need to provide a high quality service for reasonable prices does not change.

2.72. An additional threat is the potential perversion of the market through the provision of free inputs to the ewoloto families. It is extremely difficult to imagine the management of dual systems (one free and one fully paid for) being run in parallel without major difficulties. Veterinary drugs effectively become objects of currency and even the strictest of controls would find it difficult to prevent some of the free inputs finding their way into the market. The project management was alerted to some of the problems in providing unlimited care for ewoloto families and stricter controls were imposed with a ceiling being placed on total inputs to each family in each year.

2.73. There is evidence of important financial investment by local Animal Keepers and it is clear that there is some genuine economic potential in private service provision. A key example is the spending on ECF vaccinations, which at 5,000 TZS per animal represents a serious investment. Nevertheless, the approach of providing fixed remuneration for the veterinary workers and guaranteeing payment for visits has created a false situation which could not be sustained by the income that could be collected from animal keepers.

2.74. There are genuine problems in creating a viable private service to pastoralist producers. The income can probably only come from sales of drugs and ECF vaccinations and some parts of the NCA do not contain a sufficiently large market to pay for a full-time employee. The use of CAHWs would mitigate these problems by increasing the reach of the vet services without significantly increasing the costs. However, the success of a private veterinary service depends on reaching monopoly or near-monopoly of drug sales and making relatively small margins on each sale so that the cost of coming to a CAHW is not significantly above that of going to another source. Animal Keepers will choose to use the CAHW-based system if the advice is perceived to be good and the quality of drugs is always good. It may take some time to demonstrate these two qualities to animal keepers and one error or the use of poor quality drugs in order to boost incomes would set the practice back by a considerable period of time.

Project management

2.75. A detailed economic study of private veterinary practice in the area has been recommended and should have been carried out. Project records should provide all the information necessary to do the necessary studies on the economics of veterinary provision and allow the project to contribute to a national debate on preferred models of privatisation. Unfortunately the project records may not be reliable enough for such work since there are many problems in accuracy both due to lack of competence and lack of honesty. The project was alerted to such problems which were part of the reason one of the PVPs had to leave the project. Further problems have come to light since then and again the project management should have been able to detect and deal with the irregularities without external inputs. The use of external consultants to point out management failings does not create a good situation and it has led to the expression of a lot of bad feeling. The failings of management require some explanation since the problems were predictable and changes were not made in management practices after the first problems were identified.

Issues in the Approach

2.76. Overall the project has pursued a mixed process of free services, subsidised services¹³ and fully paid for services. The Private Veterinary Professionals have not been able to provide a level of service or accuracy of reporting that would give any confidence for the sustainability of their inputs. The approach through Animal Health Assistants does not appear to be likely to provide either the reach or the quality or the sustainability of provision that would be desired. The CAHW approach has not been addressed yet and a great deal of work remains to be done in this area of work. The management by the project has not been adequately attentive or supportive.

Gender Approach

2.77. Overall the project has demonstrated a weak gender approach but there are signs of continuing efforts to improve the awareness of staff and the project approach. The fact that the gender study was carried out by the project is a good sign and demonstrates a level of commitment to an effective gender approach. It should also be noted that there are women in most committees that have been promoted by the project. Often the presence of women is only a small minority of the committee but the presence is worth noting in its own right. The PC, for example, which was not constituted by the project, has a membership of 41 which includes only 6 women.

2.78. There have been positive initiatives in most areas to promote better understanding of the different issues facing men and women. The gender training for the project officers was declared to be useful and the PLA work produced a number of examples of awareness raising among staff and perhaps also at community level. The most remarked upon case being the development of daily time use diagrams in which the long hard day of women's work is seen in stark contrast to the shorter easier day described for the men.

2.79. Attempts to support women's groups in income generating activities have been very muddled and have never been a priority for the project field officers or project management. Only one of the six PFOs is a woman. The policy position that prevents the use of credit seriously constrains what can be offered in to women's income generation initiatives.

2.80. A radical gender approach would have been inappropriate in the relatively conservative nature of the social environment. More might have been done if the focus of project effort had not been on restocking. The project deserves praise for supporting a mechanism that produced a beneficiary population in which 40% of those restocked were women. It is not clear how much the women have remained in control of the animals that they received and some work should be done on this by the project and the Joint Review.

2.81. The focus on water should also have involved women more since they bear the responsibility for domestic water provision. However, the project focus seems to have been on provision of water for livestock. Although most water installations can serve both animal and human needs, there are very few installations uniquely for human needs. The dams that have been built have not been equipped with additional delivery mechanisms for domestic water (e.g. wells or sand filter traps). The few shallow wells

¹³ The PVPs received support in terms of soft loans and the use of project vehicles and were not always facing the full costs of the services they were providing.

that have been dug have been disappointing providing only seasonal water for a shorter period than had been hoped and in some cases the water is brackish.

Institutional Linkages and partnerships

2.82. The question of institutional linkages and partnerships is of immense importance for an externally funded project since the sustainability of impact often depends upon the institutionalisation of change.

NCAA

2.83. Relationships with the NCAA are the most important for the project and here, as indicated above, there has been a great deal of difficulty and very little success. The situation has been tense and adversarial and is slightly better mid-way through the fifth year of the project than at other times. The actual problems of co-operation are perhaps less important than the attitudinal problems and lack of mutual respect.

2.84. The lack of co-operation and openness with the NCAA has allowed a large number of unhelpful stories to circulate and questions to be asked about the use of project resources. The use of project funding in the building of water sources and in the management of the restocking has not been sufficiently transparent to prevent such stories from circulating. The poor supervision of Private Veterinary Professionals has added to the weakness of the project position.

2.85. It is difficult to manage good relationships in the highly politicised environment of the NCA in which every action is examined for political intent and the Review Preparation team can understand why project staff might have wanted to reduce the appearance of weakness that might have been construed from sackings or other disciplinary measures.

FZS

2.86. Frankfurt Zoological Society might be an obvious linkage for the project since it also depends upon NCAA for co-operation. The FZS project is focused on the conservation aspects of the Multiple-Land Use of the NCA but it might be imagined that some allegiance could be built between the FZS and the project and their common cause of getting support from NCAA. In fact, there has been absolutely no contact between the FZS and the project. This is unfortunate since successful management in the NCA depends on resolving the needs of the different functions of the area.

District Government

2.87. Links to the District Government in Loliondo have been restricted by the project focus on NCAA which relates directly to a central ministry and hardly at all to the District. More recently the involvement of project staff in party politics has increased the contacts with the local government on a personal rather than a project basis.

2.88. The VIC in Arusha is part of regional government and does have direct links with the project as described above (paragraphs 2.48 and 2.63).

Local NGOs

2.89. The original project document proposed that the work of the project would be handed over to a local NGO, the Ngorongoro Pastoralist Association (NPA). This was possibly a realistic option if the nature of the work to be handed over was to be discussed and debated until both sides were at ease with the work to be shared. It

appears to be an odd approach in the way it is expressed in the project document in that there seems to be no guarantee that an NGO would be able to adopt the programme of a bilateral project. The idea that the project could just expect another agency to want to and to be able to take over its role is unusual.

2.90. There are no operational NGOs in the NCA. Other NGOs in the Region have been engaged on contracts to provide services and studies. For example: training and gender study from TCDC and a study of small enterprise opportunities by Faida.

2.91. Informal contacts are maintained with the Pastoral Women's Council and other NGOs in Loliondo like LADO and OIDA. The contacts are irregular and have been of a low priority.

INGOs

2.92. Oxfam GB, Vetaid, Farm Africa and VSF are active in the surrounding areas and informal contacts have been made with these agencies. The contact again is irregular and based on personal rather than institutional links.

WEGS

2.93. The relationship with WEGS as advisor and works manager and in-house consultants has been described above (paragraph 2.26).

Networking and Network agencies

2.94. PINGOs and TPHGO are both agencies with networking objectives and a focus on pastoralism. The troubled history of PINGOs and the apparent rivalry between the two organisations has not provided for easy linking mechanisms between the project and other interested actors. This is unfortunate since the project would benefit enormously from supporting networks of agencies for the exchange of ideas and information.

Comments on the Approach

2.95. The approach of the project has left it with no obvious partner and no clear links to existing institutions. The collapse of the NPA and the project's weakness in collaborating with the PC have left it with no genuine or potential partner.

2.96. This is a development failure in terms of sustainability. There is no institutionalisation of project activities and no organisation that is in a position to follow up on the work done or continue with any of the interventions. As such the project resembles an emergency or relief project that has provided a range of physical inputs but no means of continuation of the processes that the project has started.

2.97. The weakness of the local networking agencies has robbed the project of easy information exchange opportunities. The links with other agencies seem to show an over dependence on personal relationships which may not survive changes of personnel in the different organisations. The lack of a networking base means that the project has no easy links into national debate or policy arena. In fact, during the first phases of the project the level of national debate has been of such a poor level that there have been few advocacy opportunities.

2.98. This situation will change with the publication in 2003 of the Participatory Poverty Assessment (PPA) and the UNDP-sponsored Policy Briefing Paper on Rangeland Management. These policy initiatives will include specific mention of the

situation of pastoralists and the issues surrounding pastoralism. The project will have ideas and information to contribute. The debate managed around Drylands management based in Nairobi is in fact a debate about pastoralism by another name and again the project might contribute if it were able to link with Kenyan based or regional initiatives. The Reconcile-IIED project may provide a regional initiative that the project could engage with.

Coherence of activities

2.99. The relevance of project activities is not in question; the needs are clear and real and high priorities for the affected populations. The project has had important impacts in the areas in which it has worked.

2.100. There has tended to be an approach based on activities rather than on communities which is typical of projects born out of relief situations and a belief in the need for rapid action. The project has tended to follow a classic relief approach in terms of definition of problems that the project activities are designed to address. This problem-focused approach is different from an approach based on the notion of facilitation and support to local initiative.

2.101. Given the nature of the origin of the approach the project a great deal has been achieved in directing the project activities into the hands of the local populations. Some elements of development and capacity building have been brought into the project style and the project staff should be congratulated for attempting to hand over some aspects of project work. A lot more might have been done if the project had started with a community development based approach from the beginning.

2.102. The coherence of the activities that were undertaken has been reasonable but has been achieved by the adoption of a focus on livestock production.

2.103. In common with many relief projects there has been a relative neglect of Monitoring and Evaluation and of advocacy opportunities. As mentioned above, there have until recently been relatively few opportunities for advocacy but the project was not oriented towards such work even if the opportunities had occurred earlier. The lack of quality M&E is harder to justify since the project has staff on the ground in positions and with the skills to collect high quality observations on project impacts.

3. FINDINGS AND LESSONS

Poverty Reduction

3.1. The project has had immediate and valuable impacts in poverty reduction through the three main activities in restocking, veterinary service provision and water provision. The impacts are likely to continue to be felt only for as long as the inputs survive. There has been relatively little institutionalisation of project processes. That is, the existing water provision will last but no new water provision will be created as a result of project work. The restocked families will benefit from their herds but no new families will be restocked with additional animals as the project has done. Interest in certain veterinary practices has increased but the veterinary services will stop almost as soon as the project support ends.

3.2. There are a few examples of the kind of initiative that would suggest some institutionalisation of the project approach. There are reports of one village creating a

water committee and negotiating with external bodies for support and managing to persuade WEGS to provide advice free of charge. There are reports of the ewoloto approach being used in contexts outside of restocking. If the Review Preparation Team had encountered large numbers of such examples we would be congratulating the project on successful institutionalisation of an effective approach. Since we know of only one or two such examples we are bound to report a weakness in this aspect of sustainability.

Consistency of management

3.3. The project work has suffered from an inconsistent management approach and a chronic lack of effective planning. Planning appears to take place but is routinely not adhered to and as a result not given serious attention. A great deal of the detail of project work is decided upon at the last minute and arrangements are made in haste leading to inefficiency and waste. PFOs regularly complain of the difficulty of being able to follow through on plans since they are overturned by later decisions by management.

3.4. Overall the management appears to lack a strategic direction so that initiatives are welcomed and then not followed up. A development project might be expected to follow a process adapted to each community or each community initiative. The ERETO project does not appear to have such a set of processes that are being followed. PFOs do not seem to know what will be expected of them in future periods of any length of time.

3.5. There is a serious lack of delegation in the management style so that staff in the wards are unable to make or follow through on plans and again there is inefficiency and inconsistency. The empowerment of ward-level staff would allow a much more consistent approach to work with the community rather than work focused on the completion of activities. The staff should be encouraged and rewarded for providing good monitoring information and planning their own initiatives.

3.6. The use of PLA skills has not become functional and integrated into project reporting and management. A large number of opportunities for planning initiatives and for monitoring the impact of initiatives are squandered because of a lack of attention to the potential and a lack of appreciation of the need to demonstrate impact.

Approach and Priorities

3.7. The project approach is a strange mix of effective participation and imposition of project methods. The project is in a position to move into more effective and consistent methods of development work but some change is required in management style to allow this to happen.

3.8. The difficulties of collaboration with the NCAA and the complications in attempting to support the PC have prevented the project from creating links that might provide for some sustainability of activities. I am not suggesting that it would have been easy for the project to collaborate with these agencies and in any case the focus of the project was very much on the completion of its own activities. Nevertheless all the project reports mention the need for such collaboration to increase the probability of sustainable impact.

3.9. The linkages to other agencies working in the geographical area and in the livestock and pastoralism sectors appear to have become the work of the Technical

Advisor and although this has been remarkably effective it is not an appropriate or sustainable mechanism for the creation of sustainable partnerships in the longer term.

3.10. Overall the approach is consistent with a relief programme in which the completion of activities against tight deadlines is the main method and style of work. The project has done the project activities rather than encourage and facilitate the work being done by others. The doing of the work has preoccupied the project resources and staff and prevented sufficient attention being paid to institutional links, capacity building and monitoring of impact.

3.11. The overall assessment of the Review Preparation Team is generally very positive despite the fact that the forgoing ten paragraphs contain a large number of negative observations. Although there are weaknesses in management and in the approach these can be corrected relatively easily and a new phase of project work would start from a basis of important achievements at community level. The changes required are not very different from those expected of many projects that start in relief mode and need to move into development mode.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations to ERETO project staff

Capacity building

Ewoloto

4.1. The project should pursue the empowerment of institutions as soon as this report is received rather than wait for a new phase and a new approach. The final stages of the ewoloto distributions should be handed over to the ewoloto committees who should simply be provided with funds and simple instructions for reporting and accounting.

4.2. Weaker ewoloto committees could be helped by stronger and the project should facilitate exchange visits so that learning can be shared between the different committees. This is likely to be more effective than relying on the exchanges of learning in the ISWs. Project staff could still act as advisors to an ewoloto committee that requests assistance but they should not lead the process again.

The Pastoralist Council

4.3. Negotiations should start with the PC on the provision of material assistance and capacity building inputs. Support to the PC would be an important part of any new project and work could start at once.

Monitoring before the Joint Review

4.4. The Joint Review will require good quality impact data and observations and the project Field Officers should start to collect such material at once so that it can be presented to the Review team.

4.5. The Review Preparation Team is aware that the ERETO staff will have a lot of work to do in preparing for the Joint Review and these additions are not suggested lightly. We presume, however, that basic data of survivorship of the ewoloto animals and similar routine observations will be made available in simple accessible formats. The existing six-monthly and annual reports will not be sufficiently detailed to allow the Joint Review Team to carry out their work.

4.6. The following suggestions for impact assessment have been made before and are included here for completeness. The project management would have to adopt some changes in order to see through the collection of such information.

Potential monitoring activities

4.7. The following table sets out some exercises that might be carried out and the observations that could be collected to present to the Joint Review Team.

Well-being ranking (men and women)	Changes in ranking of ewoloto families. Are women recipients still controlling livestock?
Pie-charts on water provision	Changes in availability of water in dry season sources.
Pie-charts on animal disease	Changes in the relative prevalence of different animal diseases.
Daily-Time Use	Changes in use of women's time in dry season water collection.
Mapping	Movements of people in relation to water provision. Changes in the extent of cultivation. Changes in patterns of pasture use.

4.8. It would also be very useful to be able to present the Joint Review Team with an annotated bibliography of important papers and documents. The annexes of the reports of the Review Preparation Team will be helpful.

4.9. Basic monthly market data on animal prices during the first phase of the project will also be helpful. It will show how project costs were affected and would provide the background information necessary to demonstrate whether or not the project purchases of animals affected local market prices.

Recommendations to the Joint Review Team

These comments are not specific recommendations but simply suggestions for where the focus of attention and the weight of enquiry of the Joint Review should be put.

4.10. The main findings of this preparation suggest that the Joint Review should give a great deal of attention to the institutional arrangements and management style. The real impacts in poverty reduction should be followed up and some better assessment of the extent of the impacts is required. However, it will be important not to spend too much time on this since the project staff should be able to provide most of the groundwork for these assessments.

4.11. Some attention should be addressed to the *ewoloto* committees and water committees and their abilities to manage existing and future initiatives. The views of members of these committees on the way the project has worked will be important.

4.12. Key questions remain over the nature of relationships with the NCAA and the PC and some work is required on devising better ways of working. This is probably the most important job for the Joint Review. The nature of possible relationships with the District and Regional administration also needs to be examined.

4.13. The first phase of the project has created a great deal of important learning and the Joint Review should examine better ways of exporting the learning to local networks and to national or regional level debate. There is also a potential role that should be explored in promoting and encouraging debate through facilitating and hosting events.

ANNEX 1

PEOPLE MET

HE Birgit Storgaard-Madsen	RDE Dar es Salaam	
Ms. Jespersen	RDE Dar es Salaam	
Anne Marie Rosenlund	RDE Dar es Salaam	
Rob Allport	VETAID	
Lieve Lynnen	TTBDCP	
Guisepe di Gulio	VETAGRO	
Ntui	VIC	
Dr. Mbise	VIC	
Hallu	NCAA	Community Development
Ngatait ole Lerug	Group meeting in Oloirobi	
Nandet Kitissa	..	
Lomayani ole Pose	..	
Dr. Ngowi	Ereto Vet professional	
Oldikir Nduyoto	Group meeting in Meshili	
Letee Ngoidiko	..	
Naisula Maiko	..	
Molonget Lorgoo	..	
Oloitai Oloondare	..	
Sendeu Milia	..	
Christopher Oloju	..	
Metui Shaudo	Pastoral Council	
Raphael Ndooki		
Manie Osokoni		
Raphael ole Nasi		
Bryson Oloongowarak		
Philepo Lempere		
Mbirias ole Rinya	Steering committee	
Saimon Naseya		
Godfrey Lelya	Oxfam GB	
Ngobei ole Runguna	Alaigwanani	
Matthew ole Timan	MP	
Loserian ole Madi	OICA	
Fidelis Mafuki	OICA	
Edward Pararia	LADO	
Metui Ole Tipap	LADO	
Dr. P.M. Loomu	District Veterinary Officer	
Dismas	CRT	
Lazaro Parkipuny		
Mike Sansom	African Initiatives	
Peter Mabungo	DAS Ngorongoro district	
Tingiwanyuma Castor	DED	
Simon Soenda	Chairman	District Council
Francis ole Ikayo	Councillor Endulen	
Francis Shomet	Austro-project	
Benedict ole Nangoro	CORDS	
Nyambilila Minga	FAIDA	
Emmanuel Kallonga	Hakikazi Catalyst	
Francis Siapa	PC founder member	
Jan-Erik Studsrød	Royal Norwegian Embassy	First Secretary
Rawson P. Yonazi	Vice-President's Office, Division of Environment	Assistant Director
Richard Musingi	President's Office Regional Administration and Local Government	Director of regional Co-ordination

Eugene Owusu
Mary Kabatange

UNDP
UNDP

Deputy Resident Representative
Assistant Resident
Representative
Programme officer

Katrin Lervik
Tarimo,
Allan Kijaazi
Maj. Gen.(Rtd.) Sam T.
Laiser
Hans Duinmayer,
Victor Runyoro
Stella Maranga

UNDP
Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism
NCAA
NCAA

Research and Planning Officer
Chairman of the Board of
Directors

WEGS, Arusha
NCAA
MS-TCDC, Arusha

Principal Ecologist,

DOCUMENTS CONSULTED

Project Reports

Project Document, Ngorongoro Pastoralist Project, Tanzania, December 1997, Danida.

Ereto - Ngorongoro Pastoralist Project, Project Implementation Plan Phase II, 01.01.2001 to 30.06.2003. Prepared by PIU, Ereto-NPP.

Ereto – NPP Annual report 1999, Covering period 01.01.1999 – 21.12.1999.

Ereto – NPP Annual report 2000, Covering period 01.01.2000 – 21.12.2000.

Ereto – NPP Annual report 2001, Covering period 01.01.2001 – 21.12.2001.

Steering Committee, Minutes of the 9th meeting, 6 May 2002.

Steering Committee, Minutes of the 7th meeting, 8 March 2001.

Steering Committee, Minutes of the 6th meeting, 20 June 2000.

Steering Committee, Minutes of the 5th meeting, 2 March 2000.

Steering Committee, Minutes of the 4th meeting, 21 May 1999.

Steering Committee, Minutes of the 3rd meeting, 5 December 1998

Steering Committee, Minutes of the 2nd meeting, 25 September 1998.

Ereto – NPP, Training Plan for 2002.

Concept note for next phase of Ereto –NPP, Proposed time frame July 2003 to July 2009, (Prepared by Carol Sorensen, April 2002).

Concept note for next phase of Ereto –NPP, in NCA, Proposed time frame July 2003 to July 2009, Prepared by PIU, Ereto-NPP.

Reports of work commissioned by the project

Joint Mid-Term Review Report Ereto – NPP URT, Final Report, February 2001.

Assessment of the Quality of veterinary services rendered by private veterinarians associated with the NPP, 15/10/00 – 28/10/00, Giuseppe di Giulio, October 2000.

Report NPP Evaluation of Ewoloto Programme, Alois ole Morindat, MS TCDC, Arusha Tanzania. (nd) (? December1999).

Workshop Report, The Participatory Planning Workshop for Ereto – NPP 5th to 7th October 2000, Facilitated by Loserian Sangale.

Ereto – NPP. Report of the gender study. Stella Maranga, MS – TCDC. December 2001.

Water Supply Feasibility Study in NCA for Ereto. WEGS Consultants. November 2001.

VIC Arusha, Consultancy report on disease monitoring in NCA/Ereto Project Area. 1st visit, 30 Jan- 1 Feb 2002.

Other Sources

A Situational Analysis of Pastoralism in Simanjiro District, Tanzania, by Ann Muir, July 1994.

Pastoral Economy, Property rights and Traditional Mutual Assistance Mechanisms among the Ngorongoro and Salei Maasai of Tanzania. Pastoral Land tenure Series Monograph 2, Tomasz Potkanski, IIED, 1997.

Project Document for Phase II of the Sector Agreement between the Ministry of NR&T with NORAD. August 1997.

Management of Natural Resources Programme, Tanzania, Phase II (1998-2002) Mid-Term Review, Kjell J. Havnevik et al, January 2001.

ASPS Lessons Learned and Future Strategy

DFID, Pastoral Livelihoods: Programme Appraisal, Final Report, Animal Health Service Delivery in Pastoral Areas of the Greater Horn of Africa, RWA International.

Agriculture, Danida Sector Policies, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Danida, October 1996.

Livestock, Danida Sector Policies, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Danida, November 1997.

Strategy for Danish Support to Indigenous Peoples, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Danida, July 1994.

Tanzania, Strategy for Danish development co-operation with Tanzania, 2001-2005, Danida, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, January 2002.

Integrated Assessment Results to Support Policy Decisions in Ngorongoro Conservation Area, Tanzania, POLEYC Project, (Policy Options for Livestock-based livelihoods, and Ecosystem Conservation), Natural Resource Ecology Laboratory, Colorado State University, Fort Collins, Colorado, USA and the International Livestock Research Institute, Nairobi, Kenya, Global Livestock Collaborative Research Support Program (GL-CRSP) University of California, Davis.